

Addendum

Mr Andrew Gibbs has queried the comparison of rates at Westown Maternity Hospital (WMH) and National Women's Hospital (NWH) recorded in Table 2.

From the data presented in Table 1 (the 'Henderson study') it is unclear if the 74 defects labelled 'C.D.H Hips Splint' are included in the total number of babies (167) reported. The authors' view is that it is unlikely that the 74 defects have not been included in the count of (167) babies as congenital dislocation of the hips (CDH) can occur in association with other defects that are included in Table 1.

However because of this uncertainty, the authors have calculated the rate for all babies (167) plus those reported as 'C.H.D Hips Splints' (74) assuming the latter represent additional individual babies. Therefore, Table 2 now also shows a WMH rate for 241 babies.

To enable an appropriate comparison, two rates for NWH are also now shown: one for all babies with diagnosed birth defects (387) and one for babies with diagnosed birth defects other than congenital dislocation of the hip (330).

Therefore, three scenarios are possible in comparing the rates at WMH and NWH:

- If the 167 babies at WMH excludes any with CDH, the rate is significantly higher than the rate at NWH which also excludes those with CDH (330);
- If the 167 babies at WMH includes babies with CDH, the rate is not significantly higher than the rate at NWH which includes those with CDH (387);
- If the 74 defects reported as 'C.H.D Hip Splints' are additional individual babies, the rate for 241 babies (167+74) at WMH is significantly higher than the rate at NWH for all babies (387).

Irrespective of the three above scenarios, the rate at WMH was significantly higher than the rates reported from Queen Mary Hospital and Northland. Of all the studies cited in Table 2, the most appropriate comparison is to the Northland study (Hanify 1980, 1981a, 1981b).

Table 2: The prevalence of birth defects in New Zealand

Place of Study	Years	Cases	Births	Rate/1,000	95% CI	
National Women's Hospital (1)	1964-67	387	16,103	24.03	21.65	26.61
National Women's Hospital (1)	1964-67	330 ^(a)	16,103	20.49	18.30	22.88
Westown Maternity Hospital (2)	1965-71	167 ^(b)	5,392	30.97	26.42	36.09
Westown Maternity Hospital (2)	1965-71	241 ^(c)	5,392	44.70	39.16	50.81
Northland (3)	1966-77	374	23,951	15.62	14.04	17.32
Queen Mary Hospital, Dunedin (4)	1967-70	119	6,151	19.35	16.03	23.16
New Zealand (5)	1978	1,440	52,137	27.62	26.16	29.13
New Zealand (6)	1980-89	11,298	504,567	22.39	21.96	22.83
National Women's Hospital – Maori (1)	1964-67	58	2,355	24.63	18.82	31.72
National Women's Hospital – NonMaori (1)	1964-67	313	12,920	24.23	21.57	27.12
Northland – Maori (3)	1966-77	144	7,587	18.98	16.00	22.37
Northland – nonMaori (3)	1966-77	228	16,253	14.03	12.24	16.00

Notes: (a) excludes 57 cases of 'dislocated hip'; (b) see note for Table 1 regarding the total number of possible cases; (c) includes 74 cases of 'C.D.H. Hips Splint' assuming these represent additional individual babies

Sources: (1) Howie and Phillips 1970; (2) Henderson study quoted in Carnachan 2002 and presented in O'Connor 2002; (3) Hanify 1980, 1981a, 1981b; (4) Buckfield 1973; (5) Foster 1984; (6) NZBDMP 1980-89.

Place of Study	Period	Cases	Births	Rate/1000	95% CI		
National Women's Hospital (1)	1964-67	380	16103	23.60	21.24	26.15	Hospital
National Women's Hospital (1)	1964-67	330 ^(a)	16103	20.49	18.30	22.88	
Westown Maternity Hospital (2)	1965-70	167	5392	30.97	26.42	36.09	Hospital
Westown Maternity Hospital (2)	1965-70	241 ^(b)	5392	44.70	39.16	50.81	
Northland (3)	1966-77	371	23951	15.49	13.92	17.19	Hospitals
Queen Mary Hospital, Dunedin (4)	1967-70	119	6151	19.35	16.03	23.16	Hospital
New Zealand (5)	1980-89	11298	504567	22.39	21.96	22.83	Births
HP - Maori	1964-67	58	2355	24.63	18.82	31.72	
HP-N.M.	1964-67	313	12920	24.23	21.57	27.12	
Hanify - M		144	7587	18.98	16.00	22.37	

Hanify - N.M.	228	16253	14.03	12.24	16.00
---------------	-----	-------	-------	-------	-------

(a) excluding CHD (b) including all 74 CHD Hip Splints

* original data not available

sources: (1) Howie and Phillips 1970 (2) Quoted in Carnachan 2002 and O'Connor 2002, (3) Hanify 1980, (4) Buckfield 1973, (5) 1980-89